Six Effective #SHEmergency Strategies for Recruitment and Retention of Female EM Residents

Amy Zeidan MD, Jennifer Love MD, Utsha Khatri MD, Cindy Hsu MD PhD, Angela Mills MD
1: Identify gender disparities encountered by female EM residents

2: Understand strategies that target recruitment and retention of female EM residents. Strategies presented will focus on gender bias awareness, promotion/advancement, contract negotiation, evaluation, award recognition, and wellness.

3: Formulate ideas to overcome implementation challenges and achieve sustainability for #SHEmergency movement
The Leaky Pipeline

- 51% Applicants
- 52% Matriculant
- 46% Residents
- 41% Faculty
- 25% Professors
- 16% Deans

2018 data from www.aamc.org
Plateau of Female EM Residents
Areas of Disparities

- Advancement/Promotion
- Speakership
- Award Recognition
- Compensation
- Evaluation
- Wellness
PennEM Ladies’ Paint Night Night
(circa 2013)
Structures of Women PDGs

Top-Down Approach

Bottom-Up Approach
Structures of Women PDGs

https://www.med.upenn.edu/focus/index.shtml

https://leadershipsummit.med.umich.edu/

Michigan Women’s Surgical Collaborative

https://mwsc.med.umich.edu/
Areas of Disparities: Advancement

- Advancement/Promotion
- Speakership
- Award Recognition
- Compensation
- Evaluation
- Wellness
### Med School Female Faculty

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Overall</th>
<th>EM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructor</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AAMC Faculty Roster, December 31, 2018 snapshot.
Gender Differences in Faculty Rank Among Academic Emergency Physicians in the United States

Christopher L. Bennett, MD, MA, Ali S. Raja, MD, MPH, Neena Kapoor, MD, Dara Kass, MD, Daniel M. Blumenthal, MD, MBA, Nate Gross, MD, and Angela M. Mills, MD

Leadership - Moustache Index

Authorship

Table 1. Sex Differences in National Institutes of Health Grant Amounts to First-Time Principal Investigators (PIs) by Grant Type, 2006-2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of Grants (% Female PIs)</th>
<th>Total Funds, $</th>
<th>Median Funds, $</th>
<th>Median Difference (95% CI)</th>
<th>P Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male PIs</td>
<td>Female PIs</td>
<td>Male PIs</td>
<td>Female PIs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All grant types</td>
<td>14 299 086 366</td>
<td>9 602 869 550</td>
<td>165 721</td>
<td>126 615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Top 50 Institutions</td>
<td>5 243 541 876</td>
<td>3 891 624 358</td>
<td>134 919</td>
<td>93 916</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


$40,000 Difference
Areas of Disparities: Speakership

Advancement/Promotion

Compensation

Evaluation

Awards Recognition

Wellness
#SHEmergency Speakership
Areas of Disparities: Awards

- Advancement/Promotion
- Speakership
- Compensation
- Evaluation
- Award Recognition
- Wellness
Figure 2. Total number of awards presented to physicians by the AAPM&R from 2006 to 2015.
# SHEmergency Awards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Award name</th>
<th>Nominee</th>
<th>Nominator</th>
<th>Due date</th>
<th>Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AWAEM/rams</td>
<td>Medical Student and Resident Award</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jan 15 - DONE</td>
<td><a href="https://docs.google.com/doc">https://docs.google.com/doc</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWAEM</td>
<td>Resident of the year</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1/15/2018 - DONE</td>
<td><a href="https://www.emra.org/ben">https://www.emra.org/ben</a>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMRA</td>
<td>SAEM Travel Grant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jan 15</td>
<td><a href="https://www.emra.org/ben">https://www.emra.org/ben</a>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWAEM</td>
<td>Early Career Award</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jan 1</td>
<td><a href="https://docs.google.com/doc">https://docs.google.com/doc</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWAEM</td>
<td>Mid Career Award</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jan 1</td>
<td><a href="https://docs.google.com/doc">https://docs.google.com/doc</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMRA</td>
<td>ACEP Teaching Fellowship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jan 15</td>
<td><a href="https://www.emra.org/ben">https://www.emra.org/ben</a>...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMRA</td>
<td>APD of the Year Award</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jan 15</td>
<td><a href="https://www.emra.org/ben">https://www.emra.org/ben</a>...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Areas of Disparities: Compensation

- Advancement/Promotion
- Award Recognition
- Speakership
- Compensation
- Evaluation
- Wellness
Compensation

Figure 2. Sex Differences in Salary According to Medical School

[Graph showing the adjusted annual salary distribution for men and women across different medical schools, with error bars indicating the 95% confidence interval (CI)].
Figure 1. Change in median salary by gender over time.
#SHEmergency + Wharton
Areas of Disparities: Evaluations

- Advancement/Promotion
- Speakership
- Award Recognition
- Compensation
- Evaluations
- Wellness
Evaluations
Gender Differences in Attending Physicians’ Feedback to Residents: A Qualitative Analysis

Anna S. Mueller, MA, PhD
Tania M. Jenkins, MA, PhD
Melissa Osborne, MA
Arjun Dayal, MD
Daniel M. O’Connor, MD
Vineet M. Arora, MD, MAPP
Enacting code leadership:
Being assertive and authoritative, keeping the appearance of calm, controlling/orchestrating the room, standing at the foot of the bed, giving orders without polite phrasing, lowering tone of voice, raising volume of voice, showing no emotion, standing tall, giving eye contact, following the algorithms, using names when assigning tasks

Stereotypical male traits & behaviors:
 Assertive, authoritative, controlled, deep voice, direct communication, dominant, loud voice, tall, unemotional

Stereotypical female traits & behaviors:
Communal, emotional, indirect communication, nurturing, polite, short, soft, submissive

Greater difference between code behavior and social norms for female vs. male residents

Strategies that helped female residents enact agentic leadership:
- Reaffirm sources of legitimate power (code pager, white coat)
- Assume code persona
- Adopt powerful code stance
- Pull back hair
- Stand on stool
- Give permission to suspend social norms
- Apologize afterward

Figure 1.
Conceptual framework for the role of gender in how internal medicine residents enact leadership during cardiopulmonary resuscitation (“code”), 2012–2013.
Areas of Disparities: Wellness

- Advancement/Promotion
- Speakership
- Award Recognition
- Compensation
- Evaluation
- Wellness
Wellness

Gender Differences in Utilization of Duty-hour Regulations, Aspects of Burnout, and Psychological Well-being Among General Surgery Residents in the United States

Allison Dahlke; Julie Johnson; Caprice Greenberg; Remi Love; Lindsey Kreutzer; Daniel Hewitt; Christopher Quinn; Kathryn Engelhardt; Karl Bilimoria;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Quotes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mentorship/leadership</td>
<td>As a woman in surgery this is what I experienced is that potentially if you don’t see that you have those mentors within your field that it can be a more difficult training process. Sometimes women can feel as though they need to join this men’s club, you know, that they have to, they’re pressured to be more like a man and less like a woman whichever the traits may be. (PGY2, Female)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The #Shemergency Leadership Panel

Utsha Khatri, MD

...in the greater Philadelphia area. All were eager to hear the advice and meet and learn from each other. The event was hosted by Penn Emergency Medicine’s #shemergency group (more...
Challenges

Future Directions

Sustainable

Generalizable

Measureable
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TOPIC</th>
<th>Mentorship</th>
<th>Speakership</th>
<th>Compensation</th>
<th>Evaluations</th>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Awards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EVENT</td>
<td>Speed Dating</td>
<td>Speaking Coach Workshop</td>
<td>Contract Negotiation Panel</td>
<td>Journal Club</td>
<td>Volunteer Activity</td>
<td>Awards Working Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLANNING</td>
<td>Create &amp; print questions</td>
<td>Identify local speaking coach</td>
<td>Invite 5 panelists to share experiences with contract negotiation</td>
<td>Select journal article on gender differences in evaluations/ feedback</td>
<td>Identify organization &amp; activity (e.g. cook dinner at local shelter)</td>
<td>3-4 Members identify awards and write nomination letters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLANNING TIME</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
<td>2 hours</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
<td>3 hours/award</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COST</td>
<td>Free</td>
<td>Possible honorarium for speaking coach</td>
<td>Wine &amp; cheese</td>
<td>BYOB</td>
<td>Activity dependent</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESOURCES</td>
<td>Online speed dating questions</td>
<td>Location specific</td>
<td>AAMC median salary resource</td>
<td>Mueller et al article</td>
<td>Local city websites</td>
<td>Specialty/Interest specific websites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TARGET AUDIENCE</td>
<td>Female residents &amp; faculty</td>
<td>All residents &amp; faculty</td>
<td>Female residents &amp; faculty</td>
<td>All residents &amp; faculty</td>
<td>All residents &amp; faculty</td>
<td>Female residents &amp; faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OUTCOME</td>
<td>Establish mentor-mentee relationship Strengthen #Shemergency community</td>
<td>Each attendee develops 5 minute talk for submission to national conference Offer time to practice at next gathering</td>
<td>Identify resources to review before interview Develop individualized goals &amp; strategies before interview</td>
<td>Identify gender neutral feedback strategies for faculty AND residents</td>
<td>Build partnerships with local communities/ organizations Support wellness of #Shemergency community</td>
<td>Increase number of award nominations and recipients by female residents/ faculty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Speed Dating
Introduce yourself, where you are from, and what brought you to this session

Do you have a women’s group at your institution? If so describe. If not, would this be valuable at your institution?

If you have a women’s group, or are thinking about starting one, what are the perceived barriers?

Follow up to question 3, what are some solutions to address these barriers?

If you have a women’s group, has it inspired change in any policies/outcomes in your dept (i.e. recruited more female residents, hired more women etc.)? If you don’t have a women’s group but hope to have one, what policies or outcomes would you like to change?
What was your major in college and were you thinking of another profession other than medicine?

What is the best evaluation you ever received and why?

Have you ever received a bad evaluation and if so, what impact did it have on you?

If you have a women’s group, do you have any events that address differences in evaluations? If no, what are some events that could focus on evals and reducing differences in evaluations (for both residents and attendings)?

Do you have a method to check yourself before giving feedback that it is not gender-biased?
Speed Dating - Round 3

What was your best weekend this year?

How do you recharge after stressful shift/week?

Does your department or program have a wellness initiative or committee?

What are examples of activities or events that you have done or could do to promote wellness for residents?

What are other initiatives or interventions that have been trialed at your institution to promote resident wellness? What worked? What didn’t work?
Did you have strong mentors in college? If so, how did you find them?

Do you currently have a mentor or sponsor? If yes, what is something they do that you value?

How does your department/program facilitate mentorship? If no mentorship is available, what are activities you could implement that would facilitate mentorship/sponsorship?

Have you ever been nominated for an award? If so, what did you appreciate most about the nomination? If no, what award would you like to be nominated for and why?

If you could create an award(s), what would it be and why?
If you could have dinner with any person (dead or alive, who would it be?

Who is the most inspiring speaker you have heard?

What is your general approach to preparing a presentation/talk?

What is your least favorite part of giving a talk/presentation?

What is your secret tip for calming your nerves right before you begin?
https://drive.google.com/open?id=1Ejz2HTIcysYxoNurh1hUgETihtfU6717